



City of Santa Ana
20 Civic Center Plaza, Santa Ana, CA 92701
Historic Resources Commission Staff Report
January 11, 2024

Topic: HEMA No. 2023-10 – The Elliott House (1904 North Heliotrope Drive)

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Adopt a resolution approving a Certificate of Appropriateness for Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2023-10.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Bejay and Laura Magnusen are requesting approval of Historic Exterior Modification Application (HEMA) No. 2023-10. Specifically, the request is to allow exterior modifications consisting of modifying four existing balconies with metal railings for child safety requirements that is consistent with Building Code regulations, which are located on all four facades at the second story; replacing the non-compatible rear (west) entrance stoop at the main residential building with a more period-appropriate stoop; adding 69 square feet to the existing garage-accessory structure in order to convert it to a three-car garage with additional storage; and expanding and repaving the driveway to accommodate a third parking space, for the Elliott House located at 1904 North Heliotrope Drive. The property was listed as "Landmark" in 2003 on the Santa Ana Register of Historical Properties and is a contributor to the National Register-listed Floral Park Historic District.

DISCUSSION

Project Location and Site Description

The subject property is located on a corner lot at the intersections of Heliotrope Drive and 19th Street. It is located on the west side of North Heliotrope Drive in the Floral Park National Register Historic District in Santa Ana. The General Plan land use designation for the site is Low Density Residential (LR) and the zoning district is Single Family Residential (R1). The site contains a 5,010-square-foot, Italian Renaissance Revival style residence, with a detached garage and accessory building that are interally attached, on a 17,670-square-foot residential lot. The property is known as the Elliott House built in 1931 and is a contributor to the National Register-listed Floral Park Historic District. The property is also individually listed as No. 332 on the Santa Ana Register of Historical

Properties (“Register”). It was placed on the Register in 2003 and was categorized as “Landmark.”

The Elliott House is a two-story single-family residence on a large corner parcel, sited with a deep setback and constructed in an Italian Renaissance Revival style. The residence has two primary facades facing North Heliotrope to the east and West 19th Street to the south, with the main entrance facing North Heliotrope. The garage is detached from the main residence, but is attached to a one-story accessory structure, located west of the residence. The main house delineates a "T" -shaped plan, composed of a one-story front wing and a two-story rear wing that makes up most of the building's footprint. The residence is clad in stucco and contains a hipped clay tile roof. Facing north Heliotrope Drive, the residence is mostly symmetrical in design, utilizing arches throughout the ground floor of both primary facades in both window and arched arcade form. The building's southeast corner of the two-story wing contains a recessed arcaded porch that covers the main entrance. The northeast corner also contains an arcade porch. Wood windows throughout the residence are mostly paired, multi-paned casement and French doors. Ground floor windows and doors are arched while upper story windows are primarily rectangular. The one-story wing's rounded transoms above the windows and doors feature angled muntins in a radiating pattern. Two iron-railed balconies with support columns are situated at the upper south façade and northeast corner of the two-story wing. A single balconette is also above the main entrance arcaded porch of the two-story wing. The ground-floor terrace is contained by a classical balustrade with urn-topped pedestals that spans both primary facades. Landscape includes a prominent front cornered lawn with palm trees throughout. Scored concrete paths curve through the landscape to the terrace.

The rear contains a two-car garage along the parcel's west property line, facing south. A one-story accessory building that is located between the garage and main residence and is internally attached to the garage, also faces south. A curved wingwall extends down from the main residence to the southeast corner of the accessory building, containing an arched rear property entrance. The garage has a rectangular footprint, clad in smooth stucco, and capped with a hipped, clay tile roof. The south façade's garage door is a paneled wood roll-up door. Although smaller, the accessory building also has a rectangular footprint, is clad in smooth stucco, has a band of multi-light wood windows that are alternating fixed and inswing operation below the roofline at the south façade, and is capped with a gable, clay tile roof.

The main house and detached garage were built in 1931. Alterations to the house include an “addition to the residence 15x22” in 1944, per historic building permits. Although the permit does not specify, it was likely for the existing accessory building that is internally attached to the detached garage. A 1937 Sanborn Map confirms that the main house and detached garage were extant at that time, and the existing accessory building was not present. A rear-yard swimming pool was added to the

property in 1957. A reroof of existing clay tiles and an interior kitchen remodel occurred in 2001.

On July 19, 2023, administrative permits were approved, for exterior restoration work. The scope includes restoring the original precast concrete balustrade, stucco exterior, and first floor doors and windows. The administrative HEMA scope also included like-for-like replacement of all second-story doors and windows to remove existing lead, with new dual glazing (except for the art glass window), removal of second-story deteriorated terra cotta and non-original concrete decking and replacement with new tiles to match original, resloping an existing decking to shed water away from the home, infill of service delivery hatch for security purposes and electrical rewiring, and in-kind replacement of rain drainage system. All 2023 administrative HEMA items follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards as analyzed by JANUS consultants in the Memorandum dated November 13, 2023 and Exhibit 7 of this report. The administrative HEMA scope of work is considered Phase I of II. All Phase I work is currently under construction except for the decking work on the upper balconies. The decking work cannot begin until after the requested HEMA is approved because it requires the temporary removal of the existing metal balcony railings. Reinstalling the metal balcony railings requires the replacement to meet current Building Code, in which a HEMA is required. Phase II scope of work is discussed below, under the Project Description section. Alterations that occurred to the property at an unknown date include the replacement of the detached garage door, which is a non-compatible wood paneled door.

The main house appears intact and is in good condition. The property is landscaped with a prominent front lawn to the east and south, including concrete pathways, manicured hedges, small and medium sized shrubs and trees, and several mature palm trees. The rear yard contains a pool near the property's northwest corner. Character-defining features of the Elliott House that should be preserved include, but may not be limited to: materials and finishes; roof configuration, materials, and detailing; massing; windows and doors; terrace, balconies and arcades; chimney; architectural details such as arches, columns, capitals, impost moldings, wing wall, garage; and original landscape features such as the palm trees and concrete paths.

Project Description

The proposed project, considered Phase II of exterior modifications to the subject property, consists of modifying four existing balconies with metal railings for child safety requirements consistent with Building Code regulations, which are located on all four facades at the second story; replacing the non-compatible rear (west) entrance stoop at the main residential building with a more period-appropriate stoop; adding 69 square feet to the existing garage-accessory structure in order to convert it to a three-car garage with additional storage; and expanding and repaving the driveway to accommodate a third parking space.

The four existing two-foot-five-inch (29 inches) tall metal railings will be modified to meet Building Code regulations consisting of a minimum of four inch spacing between railings and a minimum height of three-feet-six-inches (42 inches). The four balconies are located in the following locations: the primary (south) façade, northeast corner including both side (north) and primary (east) facades, and the northwest corner including both side (north) and rear (west) facades. The four balcony railings, which have peeling lead paint, will be removed, stripped of all lead paint, modified, and reinstalled in their existing locations on the main building in order to accommodate child safety and conform with current Building Code requirements. The modified railings will be taller with nine inches added to the lower portion of each balustrade. The new balustrade extensions will match existing in material, however a new knuckle will be placed at the top and bottom parts of the extension in order to differentiate the new from the old materials. The entire balcony railing with balustrades will sit on two four-inch metal mounting posts, making the four balconies a total of three-feet-six-inches (42 inches) tall. In order to reduce the spacing between each balustrade, six new balustrades will be added between each original balustrade (alternating new and original), and will be placed within the center of each existing scrollwork. The balustrade opening width will shrink from eight inches to three-and-a-half inches between each balustrade. The new balustrades will be a simple metal design similar to the original balustrades without knuckles in order to distinguish them apart from the originals. The existing top rail and metal scroll work at all four balconies will not be modified and will remain in place.

The non-compatible rear (west) façade concrete stoop with flagstone veneer and metal railing at the rear entrance will be removed entirely and replaced with a more compatible entrance stoop. The existing stoop with four concrete steps accessible south of the entrance will be replaced with a new stoop that will have three concrete steps leading from both the north and south of the new stoop. Two new wrought iron hand rails will attach to the exterior wall of the main house. A new masonry wall of five-feet-two-inches in width and four-feet-eight-inches in height will be added in front of the rear entrance.

The existing two-car garage and accessory structure will be modified with 69 square feet added to the north façade of the accessory structure footprint in order to accommodate a new, third parking space with additional storage. The addition will replace non-original double paneled doors with new, wood-frame multi-light double doors and multi-light side lights at the rear (north) façade. It will also require moving an original rear pedestrian garage door slightly north along the east façade, in place of an existing original double-hung wood window, to accommodate the new square footage. The double-hung window will be removed. Two new interior partitions will also be added inside the garage/accessory structure to create new storage space, at the northwest corner and at the east respectively. Both storage partition spaces will have new exterior doors added for access, which will be located on rear/secondary facades and will not be visible from the public right-of-way. One of the new doors will require removal of a non-original rear-facing window. Modifications required at the primary (south) façade of the accessory building include the removal of a band of upper wood windows, which are alternating fixed and

inswing operation, and lower wall to accommodate a new, third garage door. The building expansion will also require the existing clay tile roof ridge on the accessory structure to extend to the existing garage roof. The new roof portion will be clad in clay tiles to match existing.

The project also includes additional items that are not part of the Historic Exterior Modification Application (HEMA) as they are considered administrative and approved at the Staff level. For reference, administrative items include the replacement of the south driveway and the removal of non-original metal security fencing and a masonry block wall at the northeast corner of the residence. In order to accommodate the additional parking space, the existing concrete driveway and apron will be replaced and expanded. The apron will be expanded with eight additional feet to the east and a new curb cut will be created. The fencing will be replaced with a new security wall and wood gate to allow easier circulation to the rear yard. A new decomposed granite pathway will be added along the north property line leading from the sidewalk to the east to the new wood gate to the west. The pathway will require the removal of some existing shrubs along its path and for access to the sidewalk. Additionally, minimal landscape features will be removed as part of the driveway expansion, which includes some grass and part of the existing south hedge that will be trimmed to allow for the driveway sight triangle.

Analysis of the Issues

As proposed, the project will follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SOIS) for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, & Reconstructing Historic Buildings (Kay D. Weeks and Anne E. Grimmer, revised 2017). The proposed exterior modifications would be considered a rehabilitation project and as such be evaluated against ten criteria. The Memorandum by Janus Consultants dated November 13, 2023 and Exhibit 7 of this report assessed the proposed project against the SOIS for Rehabilitation and determined that the project is in compliance with the Standards. Staff has reviewed the proposed modifications in comparison to the SOIS. The following is a review of the findings as they pertain to the applicable criteria:

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal changes to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The project complies with Standard No. 1. The property currently maintains its historic use as a single-family residence with a detached garage. The use is not proposed to change. Although the two-car garage is proposed to be a three-car garage, the garage use shall remain. The accessory structure attached to the garage is not original and is not considered a character defining feature. Therefore, the removal of the existing band of windows and addition of a second garage door at the south façade at will not disrupt the historic property or create change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and special relationships.

2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

The project complies with Standard No. 2. The historic character of the subject property will be retained and preserved. The proposed balcony modifications will not remove any historic materials. Although the balcony's balustrades will be altered for child safety, the overall design will remain substantially intact, with additional balustrades added and a lengthened height. It does not alter any features or spaces that characterize the property. The proposed rear stoop replacement will also not remove any character-defining features that are visible from the public right-of-way, or alter features and spaces that characterize the property. The flagstone veneer is not a compatible or consistent material seen in the Italian Renaissance Revival Style or from 1931 when the residence was constructed, and therefore is likely not original. Although the existing metal handrail could be original, it is less ornately designed than others located throughout the residence and is located at the rear façade. Additionally, the garage and accessory building alterations will not remove historic materials or alter features and spaces that characterize the property. An original, east-facing pedestrian door at the garage's rear will be moved slightly north in place of an original double-hung window to accommodate the 69-square-foot addition. Alterations to the accessory structure are necessary for the third parking space and do not remove any original features as the structure itself is not original. Minor modifications the original garage are necessary for the expansion, however they are rear-facing and not substantial changes. The new driveway and security wall with wood gate will not disrupt any of the existing historic materials, features, and spaces.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The project complies with Standard No. 3. The proposed changes will not create a false sense of historical development. The proposed balcony extension will add new knuckle features to the existing balustrades in order to identify the new extensions from the old. The new balustrades to be added between the existing will have no ornamentation to distinguish them from the originals. The non-compatible rear stoop will be replaced with a more compatible yet minimal style stoop that will not create a false sense of historical development. The garage and accessory building alterations will also be compatible with the historic property without adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties. The new garage door will be a simple design made of wood with a walnut stain.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

The project complies with Standard No. 4. The project will not remove any significant features that were added over time. The accessory building attached to the detached garage is not original to the property and was likely added in 1944 per historic building permits. However, the structure is not a character-defining feature of the property and has not gained significance in its own right. Additionally, the rear (west) stoop's flagstone veneer is likely not original to the property and is not compatibly designed with the main house.

5. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

The project complies with Standard No. 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize the property will be preserved. The project does not propose to remove character-defining features or materials/finishes. Although the project includes the modification of four original metal balconies at the main residence to provide added safety, the proposed changes including elongating the balustrades and adding new balustrades to reduce the opening width, are minimal and will not cause a substantial change to the historic property. The additional items of replacing the rear (west) stoop and modifications to the garage/accessory building do not include the removal of any character-defining features or original materials/finishes.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

Standard 6 does not apply as the proposed project does not deal with issues of deterioration of existing materials or replacement of existing features.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

Standard 7 does not apply as the project will not involve chemical or physical treatments on the building and will be in full compliance with the Standards.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

Standard 8 does not apply as there are no known archeological resources onsite.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The project complies with Standard No. 9. The balcony modifications will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The balustrade extensions below the original materials will be identified by knuckles added to the top and bottom of each extension. The new balustrade's simple design will not include knuckles to differentiate them from the original materials and designs. The rear stoop alteration will also not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new stoop will be differentiated from the old through its minimal design consisting of a simple masonry wall with stucco finish and concrete steps. The wrought iron handrails on either side of the stoop will reference the previous hand rail with a curved end, which is not confirmed as an original building feature. The garage/accessory building alterations will primarily alter the accessory building footprint and exterior, which is not original to the property. The garage alterations, which consist of moving an original door, removing an original window, and adding a new door opening, are minimal in nature and will not destroy the property's significant historic materials, features, and spatial relationships. These alterations are all rear-facing and will not be visible from the public right-of-way. The new pedestrian wood door added to the garage's rear (north) façade will be custom built to resemble an existing garage door. The new, primary (south) façade garage door to be added to the accessory building will feature a wood door with narrow vertical paneling that is walnut stained, and will be understood as a compatible, non-original door. Additionally, the 69-foot rear accessory building addition will remove non-historic materials and will not alter any spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new, multi-pane wood double doors with side lights will reference but not mirror existing doors and windows on the primary structure. The new security wall and wood gate at the northeast corner will also be understood as a new site feature. Utilitarian in nature, the wood gate and wall will complement the historic property.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The project complies with Standard No. 10. The proposed project is considered generally reversible, as it does not remove essential aspects of the historic

property's form and materials. Although the proposed balcony modifications are not reversible, the proposed modifications will maintain all original materials and still closely resemble the original railing design with the benefit of meeting current Building Code. The rear stoop alteration will remove the existing flagstone veneer that is likely not original, and replace it with a more compatible rear entrance steps and stoop. The garage alterations will allow the space to better function while providing compatible exterior alterations that are considered reversible, which includes moving one pedestrian door slightly north on the east façade, and the removal of one double-hung window on the garage's east façade, to accommodate the accessory structure's rear addition. The accessory structure is not original and therefore proposed changes do not impact the historic property.

In conclusion, staff has determined that the project complies with *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. Specifically, the analysis indicates that the proposed balcony and stoop modifications, and garage/accessory building alteration and addition will be compatible and consistent with the existing architectural elements that reflect the original Italian Renaissance Revival style architecture while being mindful not to disturb the historic materials that characterize the property. Although the balcony modifications are visible from both primary facades, they are minimal and considered reversible. The stoop and garage/accessory building alterations are primarily rear-facing. The new work will be differentiated from the old and the property will maintain its historic and character-defining features. Although the accessory building is not original, the rear 69-square-foot addition will also allow for the option for it to be removed in such a way that the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment will be unimpaired.

The role of the Historic Resources Commission is to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness upon finding that the proposed modifications do not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic properties per Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards per CEQA and the City's Certified Local Government agreement with the State of California. Staff finds that the historic exterior modification application meets the necessary criteria to be awarded a Certificate of Appropriateness and should be approved. It is also recommended that staff approve the exact materials and finishes to be used prior to installation to ensure quality and compatibility.

Public Notification

The subject site is located within the Floral Park Neighborhood Association. The president of this Neighborhood Association was notified by mail 10 days prior to this public hearing. In addition, the project site was posted with a notice advertising this public hearing, a notice was published in the Orange County Reporter and mailed notices were sent to all property owners within 500 feet of the project site. At the time of this printing, no correspondence, either written or electronic, had been received from any members of the public.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act, the recommended action is exempt from further review under Section 15331, Class 31, as this action is designed in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. Based on this analysis, a Notice of Exemption, Environmental Review No. 2023-123 will be filed for this project.

FISCAL IMPACT

There is no fiscal impact associated with this action.

EXHIBIT(S)

1. Resolution
2. 500-Foot Radius Map – 1904 North Heliotrope Drive
3. Site Photos
4. Resolution 2003-04 – 1904 North Heliotrope Drive (Historic Listing and Categorization)
5. Executive Summary and Historic Description
6. Architectural Plan Set
7. Janus Consultants Memorandum dated November 13, 2023
8. Copy of Public Notices

Submitted By: Andrea Heywood, Associate Planner

Approved By: Minh Thai, Executive Director of Planning and Building Agency, Planning and Building Agency