

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-03

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA APPROVING THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1002, 1004, AND 1004 ½ N. FRENCH STREET; AND 313, 313 ½ AND 315-317 E. TENTH STREET (COLLECTIVELY 1002 N. FRENCH STREET) FOR HISTORIC EXTERIOR MODIFICATION APPLICATION NO. 2024-03 (APN: 398-027-15)

BE IT RESOLVED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana hereby finds, determines and declares as follows:

- A. Carlos Bustamante, with Urban Living Properties, LLC (property owner and applicant) is requesting approval of Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2024-03 to allow exterior modifications to the property at 1002, 1004, and 1004 ½ N. French Street; and 313, 313 ½ and 315-317 E. Tenth Street (collectively 1002 N. French Street), historically known as the St. Thomas-Hamilton House.
- B. The legal owner of the property is Urban Living Properties, LLC, a California limited liability company.
- C. The St. Thomas-Hamilton House is a contributor to the French Park National Register Historic District. The French Park National Register Historic District is also listed in the California Register of Historical Resources.
- D. The St. Thomas-Hamilton House was originally built in 1898, in the Colonial Revival style. It is a single-story, multi-family residence, located on a moderately sized parcel, with a simple mid-century style two-story addition, added in the 1940s. Character-defining features of the single-story portion of the St. Thomas-Hamilton House that should be preserved include, but may not be limited to: hipped roof, enclosed eaves and a moulding-trimmed frieze, narrow clapboard siding, wide shiplap siding, original exterior doors, mouldings, porch posts, brackets, wood balustrades, frieze spindles, spandrels, and skirting.
- E. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, no exterior physical modifications, other than those identified by the Historic Resources Commission for administrative approval by city staff, shall be permitted with respect to a historic structure until the Historic Resources Commission approves such request at a duly noticed public hearing and issues a

certificate of appropriateness. The Historic Resources Commission shall issue the certificate of appropriateness upon finding that the proposed modification(s) does not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property.

- F. The applicant proposes to retain and restore three (3) existing wood doors and mouldings, one along the south elevation and two along the east elevation, to period-correct style. As part of the work, the existing metal door screens will be removed. The conditions of the existing doors have been assessed, and where possible, the existing historic fabric will be retained and repaired. In instances where deterioration is too severe for repair, the new elements will match the existing in material and design.

Along the southern and eastern elevation, the work also includes rehabilitation of the existing porch by removing a non-original porch enclosure and restoring it to match previously existing. The work to the porch would include the following:

- Wrap-around columns and porch elements, to be restored, and the elements too deteriorated to be repaired will be repaired using in-kind materials and match existing in material, dimension, and detail;
- The frieze spindles are to be restored, and elements too deteriorated to be repaired will be repaired using in-kind materials and match existing in material, dimension, and detail;
- Any missing or damaged baluster spindles to be restored/fabricated using in-kind materials and to match existing in material, dimension, and detail.
- New wood balustrade rails, to be fabricated, using in-kind materials and match existing in material, dimension, and detail;
- Wrap-around block fascia at porch deck, to be restored using in-kind materials matching existing; and
- Repair and restore exterior fascia using in-kind materials and match existing in material, dimension, and detail.

The proposed work would also include the removal of all non-original wood and/or wrought iron railings, including the porch stoop railings along the south and east elevation, and the existing stair guard railings for the two-story addition, along the south and north elevation. The concrete stoops leading to the original porch are proposed to remain, and would be enhanced with concrete pier walls and a simple metal guardrails. Two additional concrete stoops, one each along the south and east elevation, are also proposed to remain and would include a new simple metal stair guard railing, with the baluster guard railing not wider than four-inches wide. The existing stairs leading to the second story addition, as well as the existing second story walkways, would also include the new simple metal stair guard railings. All new metal stair guardrails are proposed to be

finished in a darker tone to reduce from view, and proposed to be simple in form and styling (e.g., no knuckles or twists).

Lastly, the applicant proposes to restore the basement vent screens to match existing block fascia at wrap-around porch, and to install new exterior sconce lighting in period correct style. As proposed, all exterior repairs will be done using in-kind materials. Exterior siding too deteriorated to repair will be replaced with custom-mill siding to match original in-kind.

- G. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, the Historic Resources Commission held a duly noticed public hearing on July 15, 2024, for the request for exterior modifications to the St. Thomas-Hamilton House.
- H. Since the property is deemed a historic structure, all exterior modifications are required to meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - 1. The following Secretary of Interior's Standards are applicable:
 - i. The project complies with Standard No. 1. As conditioned, the project complies with Standard No. 1. The property currently maintains its historic use as a multi-family residence. The use is not proposed to change. Although the applicant proposed exterior modifications to remove an existing porch enclosure, the porch enclosure is known to be a later modification and was not completed using the same level of craftsmanship as the home. The enclosure does not represent a particular style and does not appear to have taken on any significance in its own right over time. The SOIS support the contemporary use of the property while preserving the functional and decorative features of the historic porch. Repairs will be made to features, which remain serviceable, while those too deteriorated will be replaced with in-kind replacements based upon sound evidence discovered onsite.
 - ii. The project complies with Standard No. 2. As conditioned, the project complies with Standard No. 2. The historic character of the subject property will be retained and preserved. The proposed exterior alterations, as conditioned, shall remove as little historic material at the primary facades. The majority of the alterations are located on south and east elevation, and involve the removal on a non-original porch enclosure. The porch enclosure is known to be a later modification and was not completed using the same level of craftsmanship as the original home. The enclosure does not represent a particular style and does not appear to have taken on any significance in its own right over time. Moreover, character-defining features (e.g., existing porch posts, brackets, balustrade, frieze, spandrels, and skirting) will all be retained and restored

to period-correct style, as part of the overall porch rehabilitation.

The overall work also includes the replacement of existing (non-historic) wooden railings. While the existing porch stoop railings were replaced using turned wood balusters, they are not of the same design as the extant historic examples. The large amount of non-historic wooden railings and their prominence within the overall character of the property creates a false sense of history which diminishes the historic character of the property. The repetitious use of wooden balusters at both the historic and later entrances also lacks order, and thus competes with the authentic historic elements. Therefore, their removal would be in keeping with the SOIS and would not affect the historic character of the subject property.

- iii. The project complies with Standard No. 3. The project complies with Standard No. 3. The proposed changes will not create a false sense of historical development. The applicant proposes an overall hierarchical approach to the exterior modifications, to bring more prominence to the original entry porch, while reducing the impacts of the later modifications (i.e. subsequent entry doors and stoops, staircase to upper level). Specifically, the applicant is proposing to retain the existing non-historic concrete stoops, both at the porch and at the entrances subsequently added at the south and east elevations. The existing concrete porch stoops are presumed to be non-original to the house and are most likely later modifications. Although the original porch steps were most likely constructed of wood, the existing concrete stoops are non-descript in character, and do not significantly diminish the overall historic character of the property. The applicant would install concrete pier walls at porch stairs, which are compatible with the historic porch elements, but that are also differentiated to not create a false sense of history. Moreover, the applicant proposes to install metal handrails and guardrails, simple in form and styling (i.e., no knuckles or twists) and finished in a dark color so that they recede from view, at all secondary entrances, as well as staircases to upper level. These new handrails and guardrails will read as contemporary, not conjectural, given the lesser amount of space between each guardrail. Lastly, all character-defining features (e.g., existing porch posts, brackets, balustrade, frieze, spandrels, and skirting) will all be retained and restored

to period-correct style, which will blend in with the building and not be considered a conjectural alteration.

- iv. The project complies with Standard No. 5. As conditioned, the project complies with Standard No. 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize the property will be preserved. The majority of the project does not propose to remove character-defining features or materials/finishes along any façade. Although two of the three doors along the south and east elevation are not original, they are presumed to have been relocated from another location in the house when later additions occurred, considering that they both match the one original primary entry door. The historic assessment further notes that the additional entrance openings, occurred prior to the historic designation of the neighborhood, and that they are now essential to the contemporary use of the property. Therefore, the applicant proposes to retain and restore the doors to a period-correct style, in keeping with this standard.

As previously mentioned, the overall work also includes the replacement of existing (non-historic) wooden railings. These porch stoop railings were replaced using turned wood balusters, and are not of the same design as the extant historic examples, creating a false sense of history, diminishing the overall historic character of the property. These railings are not an example of a distinctive features, finishes, or construction techniques, or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property. Therefore, removal of these railings would not be in conflict with this standard.

- v. The project complies with Standard No. 6. All character-defining features (e.g., existing porch posts, brackets, balustrade, frieze, spandrels, and skirting) will be retained and restored to period-correct style. The porch enclosure only partially removed sections of the original frieze and spandrels. Moreover, the existing turned porch posts, bases, capitals and brackets appear to be original the home, as well as the existing turned balusters. Lastly, the applicant proposes to restore the basement vent screens to match existing block fascia at wrap-around porch. All exterior repairs will be done using in-kind materials and exterior siding too deteriorated to repair will be replaced with custom-mill siding to match original in-kind. Therefore, replacement of missing features will be

substantiated by documentary and physical evidence, in compliance with this standard.

- vi. The project complies with Standard No. 9. The proposed building alterations will not destroy historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property at the building's primary (south and east) facades. Rather, the proposed alterations will restore the porch to the original conditions by removing a non-original porch enclosure and restoring all existing character-defining features (e.g., existing porch posts, brackets, balustrade, frieze, spandrels, and skirting) to period-correct style. The porch enclosure is known to be a later modification, does not represent a particular style, and does not appear to have taken on any significance in its own right over time.

As part of the overall work, the applicant would install concrete pier walls at the porch stairs, which are compatible with the historic porch elements, but that are also differentiated to not create a false sense of history. The work also includes the replacement of non-historic wooden railings. While the existing porch stoop railings were replaced using turned wood balusters, they are not of the same design as the extant historic examples. Moreover, the applicant proposes to install metal handrails and guardrails, simple in form and styling (i.e., no knuckles or twists) and finished in a dark color so that they recede from view, at all secondary entrances, as well as staircases to upper level. The overall simplistic design along with use of distinct materials will ensure that all alterations will be compatible with the historic building. Specifically, the concrete piers and metal railings will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

- vii. The project complies with Standard No. 10. The proposed project, as conditioned, is considered generally reversible, as it does not remove essential aspects of the building's form and materials.
- viii. Standard 4 and Standards 6-8 are not applicable. No features of this description would be affected by this Project.

Section 2. In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act, the recommended action is exempt from further review under Section 15331, Class 31, as this action is designed in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. Based on this analysis, a Notice of Exemption, Environmental Review No. 2024-54 will be filed for this project.

Section 3. The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana after conducting the public hearing hereby approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2024-03, as conditioned in Exhibit B, attached hereto and incorporated herein. The Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed modifications do not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property. This decision is based upon the evidence submitted at the above said hearing, which includes, but is not limited to: the Staff Report and exhibits attached thereto and the public testimony, all of which are incorporated herein by this reference.

Section 4. The Historic Resources Commission Secretary is hereby directed to file a certified copy of this Resolution with the County Recorder's Office after the adoption of this Resolution pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 5029.

ADOPTED this 15th day of July 2024.

Tim Rush
Chairperson

APPROVED AS TO FORM:
Sonia R. Carvalho, City Attorney

By: 
Brandon Salvatierra
Deputy City Attorney

AYES:

NOES:

ABSTAIN:

NOT PRESENT:

CERTIFICATE OF ATTESTATION AND ORIGINALITY

I, NUVIA OCAMPO, Commission Secretary, do hereby attest to and certify the attached Resolution No. 2024-03 to be the original resolution adopted by Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana on July 15, 2024.

Date: _____

Nuvia Ocampo
Commission Secretary
City of Santa Ana

EXHIBIT A
LEGAL DESCRIPTION

APN	Address	Legal Description	Owner Names
398-027-15	1002, 1004, and 1004 ½ N. French Street; and 313, 313 ½ and 315-317 E. Tenth Street (collectively 1002 N. French Street)	<p>THE LAND HEREINAFTER REFERRED TO IS SITUATED IN THE CITY OF SANTA ANA, COUNTY OF ORANGE, STATE OF CA, AND IS DESCRIBED AS FOLLOWS:</p> <p>PARCEL 1:</p> <p>THAT PORTION OF THE 106.25 ACRE PARCEL OF LAND ALLOTTED TO THE HEIRS OF TEODOCIA YORBA IN DECREE OF PARTITION OF THE RANCHO SANTIAGO DE SANTA ANA, RECORDED IN BOOK "B" OF JUDGMENTS OF THE 17TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF CALIFORNIA, DESCRIBED AS FOLLOWS:</p> <p>BEGINNING AT THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF THE TENTH (FORMERLY HERMOSA STREET) AND FRENCH STREET; THENCE NORTH 76.00 FEET; ALONG THE WEST LINE OF FRENCH STREET; THENCE WEST 121.50 FEET; THENCE SOUTH 76.00 FEET; THENCE EAST 121.50 FEET TO THE POINT OF BEGINNING.</p> <p>PARCEL 2:</p> <p>A RIGHT OF WAY FOR COMMUNITY DRIVEWAY PURPOSES OVER THE EAST</p>	Urban Living Properties, LLC

		<p>3.5 FEET OF THE SOUTH 50.00 FEET OF THAT PORTION OF THE 106.25 ACRE PARCEL OF LAND ALLOTTED TO THE HEIRS OF TEODOCIA YORBA IN DECREE OF PARTITION OF THE RANCHO SANTIAGO DE SANTA ANA, RECORDED IN BOOK "B" OF JUDGEMENT OF THE 17TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF CALIFORNIA, DESCRIBED AS FOLLOWS:</p> <p>BEGINNING AT A POINT ON THE NORTH LINE OF TENTH STREET 121.5 FEET WEST FROM THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF TENTH STREET (FORMERLY HERMOSA STREET) AND FRENCH STREET; THENCE NORTH 76.00 FEET; THENCE WEST 3.5 FEET; THENCE NORTH 55.00 FEET; THENCE WEST 25.00 FEET; THENCE SOUTH 131.00 FEET TO SAID NORTH LINE OF TENTH STREET; THENCE EAST 28.5 FEET TO THE POINT OF BEGINNING.</p> <p>APN: 398-027-15</p>	
--	--	---	--

EXHIBIT B

**Conditions of Approval for Historic Exterior Modification Application (HEMA)
No. 2024-03**

The Applicant must comply with each and every condition listed below prior to exercising the rights conferred by the Historic Resource Commission's approval and the City of Santa Ana Register of Historic Properties pursuant to Section 30-6 of the Santa Ana Municipal Code. The Applicant must remain in compliance with all conditions listed below:

1. This property is located in the French Park National Register Historic District and is a district contributor. In any real property transaction, the owner of this property or the owner's representative shall provide the buyer of this property with notice that the property is located within the French Park National Register Historic District.
2. Any changes to the approved plans or project description for HEMA No. 2024-03, including any descriptions contained within the staff report, shall be subject to Planning Division staff review. In the event staff determine that proposed changes cannot be approved administratively, the applicant shall be responsible for obtaining French Park Neighborhood Architectural Committee and Historic Resources Commission approvals, as applicable as determined by staff, at the applicant's sole full expense.
3. The owner shall procure any requested material samples of proposed exterior materials (for like-for-like and non like-for-like changes) and shall provide the samples directly to the Planning Division at City Hall upon request. If staff determines the material/design is not historically compatible, the owner shall comply with staff's required specifications for appropriate material/design.
4. Prior to permit issuance, the owner shall coordinate with Planning Division staff on the final metal railing design for the proposed porch/staircase railings, to ensure the final design includes historically appropriate and compatible decorative elements and ornamentation. The final design shall be reviewed and approved by Planning Division staff.
5. The owner is responsible for notifying staff in a timely manner if any material/model is unavailable for all work related to this project (like-for-like and non like-for-like exterior changes).

6. The owner is responsible for contacting the Planning Division to request rough and final inspections prior to final occupancy. Requests for inspections must be made at least three (3) business days in advance of the inspection.